

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

ABHINAV BHATNAGAR,
Plaintiff,
vs.
JASON INGRASSIA, individually and in
his official capacity; COUNTY OF
CONTRA COSTA; and CITY OF
SAN RAMON.
Defendants.

) Case No.: Case No. CV07-02669 (CRB)
)
)
)
)
) PROPOSED ORDER FOR
) PLAINTIFF'S 1st MOTION *IN LIMINE*
)
)
)
)
)
)
)

This matter is before the court upon Plaintiff's First Motion *In Limine*, filed on March 14, 2008. Based upon the supporting and opposing documents submitted on these motions, all the documents contained in the record herein, and the motion hearing conducted on April 25, 2008, the Court hereby issues the following rulings:

(1) The decision of Contra Costa County Superior Court Judge Charles Treat, dated November 27, 2006, in *People v. Bhatnagar*, Case No. 127484-4, granting Mr. Bhatnagar's motion to suppress and dismissing his criminal charges for driving under the influence of alcohol shall be admitted in its entirety as evidence against:

Defendant Ingrassia Contra Contra County & the City of San Ramon
These findings will will not be given collateral estoppel effect.

(2) The decision of Contra Costa County Commissioner Joel Golub, dated March 14, 2007, in *People v. Abhinav Bhatnagar*, Case No. 968674-2, finding Mr. Bhatnagar not guilty of the traffic citation issued by Defendant Ingrassia on September 29, 2006 shall be admitted in its entirety as evidence against:

Defendant Ingrassia Contra Contra County & the City of San Ramon

1 These findings _____ will _____ will not be given collateral estoppel effect.
2
3

4 (3) The decision of Department of Motor Vehicles (“DMV”) Hearing Officer J. Beireis-
5 Molnar, dated March 30, 2007, setting aside the suspension of Mr. Bhatnagar’s driver’s license
6 shall be admitted in its entirety as evidence against:

7 _____ Defendant Ingrassia _____ Contra Contra County & the City of San Ramon
8 These findings _____ will _____ will not be given collateral estoppel effect.

9 (4) The decision of Contra Costa County Superior Court Judge William Kolin, dated
10 August 8, 2007, in *People v. Raymond Eli*, Case No. 128472-8, granting Mr. Eli’s motion to
11 suppress and dismissing the criminal charges against Mr. Eli shall be admitted in its entirety as
12 evidence against:

13 _____ Defendant Ingrassia _____ Contra Contra County & the City of San Ramon
14

15 (5) The decision of Contra Costa County Superior Court Judge Nancy Stark, dated
16 August 8, 2007, in *People v. Richard Smith*, Case No. 5-070257-1, granting Mr. Smith’s motion
17 to suppress and dismissing the criminal charges against Mr. Smith shall be admitted in its
18 entirety as evidence against:

19 _____ Defendant Ingrassia _____ Contra Contra County & the City of San Ramon
20

21 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

22 Dated: April ___, 2008

23 _____
24 The Honorable Charles R. Breyer
25 United States District Judge
26
27
28